

Historic Preservation Commission
Minutes - March 12, 2025

1. Call to Order: Chairman Griffin called the meeting to order at 6:00pm.
2. Roll Call: Chairman Griffin; Commissioners Beroza, Hubbard, Sanders and Taylor were present.

Staff: Bryan Wood – Community Development Director, Emily Carson – Community Planner, Brooke Newby – City Attorney, and Christine Sewell – Recording Clerk

Guests: Mr. Brandon James

3. Citizens with Input – None
4. Approval of the Agenda- Commissioner Beroza motioned to approve as presented; Commissioner Sanders seconded; all in favor and was unanimously approved.
5. Approval of Minutes – February 11, 2025, meeting – Commissioner Taylor motioned to approve as presented; Commissioner Hubbard seconded; all in favor and was unanimously approved.
6. Announcements – Chairman Griffin referred to the notices as listed
 - a. Procedures for Public Hearings
 - b. Please place cell phones in silent mode
7. Old Business
 - a. **COA-0006-2025**. Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows at 906 Evergreen Street. The applicant is Brandon James. (*Tabled from February 11, 2025 meeting*)

Mr. Wood advised additional staff research indicates that full wood replacement windows would have to be custom made. Most window manufacturers (i.e. Pella, Andersen, Marvin) make a wood replacement window that is clad on the exterior with aluminum, fiberglass, vinyl, or a composite. Pella boasts that it has the deepest, most realistic SDL (Putty Profile). These type windows have been accepted by many historic commissions. Mr. James has provided specific quotes for his replacement windows:

- Vinyl windows with SDL grids on the outside of the glass. \$7,240. (Quote from Hang and Maintain)
- Pella Lifestyle Series windows which are aluminum-clad wood windows with simulated divided light (SDL) grids on the outside of the glass. \$20,581. (Quote from Hang and Maintain)

Additional information provided:

- Text screenshot from Luke Miller with Ocone Elite (Pella dealer) indicating wood windows with SDL grids would be \$3,823 + for each window.
- Text screenshot from unknown indicating that Andersen does not make a wood exterior window – Most historic districts have approved the Andersen A Series [interior wood with fiberglass or composite exteriors]
- Website screenshots of various Andersen window series with general cost for each.

- Text screenshot indicating Blue Dog Preservation (window restoration) is closed and no longer accepting projects.

The cost difference between vinyl and aluminum-clad wood windows, based on the quotes from Hang and Maintain, may be a sufficient reason for the Commission to consider Undue Hardship. Section from Historic Preservation Ordinance 2-3.4.4. *Application for certificate of appropriateness. (H)Undue hardship. When, by reason of unusual circumstances, the strict application of any provision of this Ordinance would result in exceptional practical difficulty or undue hardship upon any owner of a specific property, the Preservation Commission, in passing upon applications, shall have the power to vary or modify strict adherence to the provisions or to interpret the meaning of the provision so as to relieve such difficulty or hardship; provided such variances, modifications or interpretations shall remain in harmony with the general purpose and intent of said provisions, so that the architectural or historical integrity, or character of the property, shall be conserved and substantial justice done. In granting variances, the commission may impose such reasonable and additional stipulations and conditions as will, in its judgment, best fulfill the purpose of this Ordinance. An undue hardship shall not be a situation of the owner's or occupant's own making.* The applicant is requesting replacement of windows only on the side of the house. If the Commission allows vinyl, it can use the location of the replacements as justification and require a more historically accurate replacement window of the street-facing façades.

Mr. James thanked Mr. Wood for the summary and as presented the cost difference is nearly triple and if he did just the portion of the house with wood the cost is nearly \$125,000, which is an undue hardship.

Commissioner Beroza motioned to approve as presented due to a hardship under the ordinance based on the cost and the location of the replacement windows; Commissioner Sanders seconded; all in favor and was unanimously approved.

8. New Business - None

9. Other Business

a. Interpretation and use of Design Guidelines – Brooke Newby, City Attorney

Ms. Newby introduced herself and was there to review with the Commission's the process for COA applications. Ms. Newby advised the Design Guidelines provide parameters in reviewing applications; and Mr. Wood advised the Secretary of Standards can also be referenced. Ms. Newby shared DCA's guide for community meetings on how to make motions and motions should state the standards /design guidelines the application does or does not meet. Ms. Newby also advised questions should not be answered from public comment; it's best to advise the speaker you will take their question and have the appropriate staff follow back up with the answer. Discussion ensued with Ms. Newby, staff and the Commission on best practices for public meetings.

b. Commission comments and questions – The Commission inquired about the email sent on the downtown district from the city manager. Mr. Wood advised the upcoming public hearing is based on the final draft the Commission is recommending and the memo can be considered as one part of the comments in their recommendation to Council.

10. Adjournment – there being no further business to come before the Commission the meeting was adjourned at 6:51pm.

Approved 04.08.25